

Table 1: Timeline of US Worksite Immigration Enforcement Strategies

Year	Description
1986	IRCA signed into law and employer sanctions created
1988	Full enforcement of IRCA's employer sanctions goes into effect
1991	INS launches initiative to strengthen enforcement of employer sanctions
1995	Clinton memorandum stressing the importance of worksite enforcement and employer sanctions as major components of US immigration policy
1996	IIRIRA enacted; funding for worksite enforcement and employer verification increased
1999	INS switches focus of worksite enforcement from worksite raids to I-9 form auditing; Operation Vanguard
2001	September 11th terrorist attacks; PATRIOT Act signed into law
2003	DHS and ICE created; interior immigration enforcement resources directed to national security investigations; worksite enforcement limited to "critical infrastructure"
<i>Present</i>	Obama administration expands use of administrative tools, leading to tripling of I-9 audits of employers from 2008 to 2009; criminal charges against employers increased

Sources: Siskin et al 2006; Bruno 2010; Gardella 2011.

**Table 2: Means and Standard Deviations of Dependent Variables in Analysis
by Legal Status and Period**

	Total		Legal		Unauthorized	
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
Hourly Wages	9.11	6.17	10.56 ^b	6.54	8.51	5.89
1976–1986	9.51	7.09	13.07 ^b	7.89	9.08	6.89
1987–1996	8.86 ^a	5.89	10.34 ^{a b}	6.69	7.87 ^a	5.02
1997–2002	8.88 ^a	5.96	9.77 ^{a b}	5.10	8.51	6.26
2003–2009	9.74	5.13	11.56 ^b	6.91	9.01	3.99
Paid < US Average Wage	0.90	0.29	0.83 ^b	0.37	0.93	0.25
1976–1986	0.90	0.29	0.69 ^b	0.46	0.92	0.26
1987–1996	0.89	0.31	0.83 ^{a b}	0.37	0.93	0.25
1997–2002	0.93 ^a	0.26	0.89 ^{a b}	0.30	0.94	0.24
2003–2009	0.93	0.26	0.84 ^{a b}	0.36	0.96 ^a	0.19
Paid by Check	0.77	0.42	0.89 ^b	0.31	0.73	0.45
1976–1986	0.77	0.41	0.88 ^b	0.32	0.76	0.42
1987–1996	0.74 ^a	0.43	0.89 ^b	0.31	0.65 ^a	0.47
1997–2002	0.79	0.41	0.89 ^b	0.31	0.75	0.43
2003–2009	0.85 ^a	0.36	0.90 ^b	0.29	0.83 ^a	0.38
Taxes Withheld	0.77	0.42	0.92 ^b	0.27	0.72	0.45
1976–1986	0.73	0.44	0.86 ^b	0.34	0.72	0.45
1987–1996	0.76 ^a	0.42	0.92 ^b	0.27	0.66 ^a	0.47
1997–2002	0.79 ^a	0.41	0.92 ^b	0.27	0.75	0.43
2003–2009	0.85 ^a	0.33	0.93 ^b	0.25	0.82 ^a	0.38
N	5324		1522		3802	

Data: MMP (128)

Note: ^aStatistically significant difference from 1976-1986 (two-tailed t-test, $p < .05$);

^bStatistically significant difference from unauthorized immigrants (two-tailed t-test, $p < .05$).

**Table 3: Results of OLS Regression Predicting Log of Hourly Earnings
(2005 constant dollars)**

	Total ^a		Legal		Unauthorized				
	B	SE ^b	B	SE ^b	B	SE ^b			
<i>Legal Status</i>									
Unauthorized (ref = Legal)	-0.214	***	0.023	–	–	–			
<i>Period (ref = 1976–1986)</i>									
1987–1996	-0.190	***	0.018	-0.250	***	0.038	-0.162	***	0.025
1997–2002	-0.177	***	0.028	-0.228	***	0.052	-0.138	***	0.032
2003–2009	-0.026		0.027	-0.025		0.050	-0.015		0.031
<i>US Experience</i>									
No. of US Trips	0.009	***	0.002	0.008	***	0.001	0.016	*	0.004
<i>Type of US Job (ref = Prof/Skilled)</i>									
Blue Collar	-0.240	**	0.082	-0.212	**	0.091	-0.245	†	0.112
Low Skill	-0.375	***	0.072	-0.348	***	0.095	-0.375	**	0.105
Agricultural	-0.442	***	0.086	-0.444	***	0.103	-0.418	**	0.116
<i>Demographics</i>									
Female (ref = Male)	-0.301	***	0.039	-0.314	***	0.072	-0.291	***	0.037
Age	0.005	†	0.003	0.021	*	0.009	0.001		0.004
Age ²	-0.001	***	0.001	-0.001	*	0.001	-0.001		0.001
Education (in years)	0.014	***	0.002	0.018	***	0.004	0.013	***	0.002
Rural Origin (ref = Urban)	0.035		0.025	0.039	*	0.019	0.035	†	0.030
US Sample (ref = MX)	0.107	***	0.013	0.191	***	0.045	0.042		0.029
<i>US Employment Conditions</i>									
State Unemployment Rate	-0.009	†	0.005	-0.002		0.005	-0.012	†	0.007
Constant	2.587	***	0.102	2.145	***	0.245	2.457	***	0.174
R ²	0.119			0.140			0.083		
F	437.88	***		136.24	***		130.83	***	
N	4825		1389		3436				

Data: MMP (128); Note: *** p < .001; ** p < .01; * p < .05; † p < .10;

^aSignificant (p < .001) Chow test (χ^2) indicates separate regression equations for legal and unauthorized;

^bStandard errors clustered by household and US state of residence.

Table 4: Selected Results of Logistic Regressions

	Total ^a		Legal		Unauthorized				
	B	SE ^b	B	SE ^b	B	SE ^b			
Panel A: Earn < US Avg.									
<i>Legal Status</i>									
Unauthorized (ref = Legal)	0.902	***	0.092	–	–	–			
<i>Period (ref = 1976–1986)</i>									
1987–1996	0.524	***	0.137	0.707	**	0.224	0.361	0.252	
1997–2002	0.978	***	0.145	1.267	***	0.354	0.744	**	0.260
2003–2009	0.931	**	0.353	0.816	*	0.378	1.084	*	0.326
Panel B: Payment by Check									
<i>Legal Status</i>									
Unauthorized (ref = Legal)	-0.906	***	0.134	–	–	–	–		
<i>Period (ref = 1976–1986)</i>									
1987–1996	-0.522	***	0.096	-0.122		0.307	-0.572	***	0.097
1997–2002	-0.103		0.086	0.185		0.394	-0.148	†	0.082
2003–2009	0.389	**	0.133	0.423	*	0.191	0.398	**	0.139
Panel B: Tax Withholding									
<i>Legal Status</i>									
Unauthorized (ref = Legal)	-1.246	***	0.145	–	–	–	–		
<i>Period (ref = 1976–1986)</i>									
1987–1996	-0.355	***	0.090	0.104		0.336	-0.391	***	0.092
1997–2002	0.016		0.094	0.208		0.253	0.006		0.112
2003–2009	0.480	**	0.192	0.625		0.439	0.483	*	0.200

Data: MMP (128); Note: *** p < .001; ** p < .01; * p < .05; † p < .10.

Note: Controls for demographics, US job, US experience, and US employment context not shown.

^aSignificant (p < .001) Chow test (χ^2) indicates separate regression by legal status;

^bStandard errors clustered by household and US state of residence.